1	JOHN C. CRUDEN												
2	Assistant Attorney General Environment and Natural Resources Division												
	Environment and Natural Resources Divi	sion											
3	JOSHUA H. VAN EATON (WA-39871)												
4	BETHANY ENGEL (MA-660840)												
5	Trial Attorneys Environmental Enforcement Section												
6													
7	U.S. Department of Justice P.O. Box 7611												
	Washington DC 20044-7611												
8	Telephone: (202) 514-5474												
9	Facsimile: (202) 514-0097 Email: Josh.Van.Eaton@usdoj.gov												
10	Emain. Josh. Van. Eaton & asaoj.go	•											
11	Attorneys for Plaintiff United States of An	nerica											
12	UNITED ST	ATES DISTRICT COURT											
13	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION												
14	SAINFR	ANCISCO DI VISION											
	IN DE VOLVOWACEN "CLEAN	)											
15	IN RE: VOLKSWAGEN "CLEAN DIESEL" MARKETING, SALES	)											
16	PRACTICES, AND PRODUCTS	Case No: MDL No. 2672 CRB (JSC)											
17	LIABILITY LITIGATION	SECOND PARTIAL CONSENT											
18		DECREE											
19		Hon. Charles R. Breyer											
		) Hon. Charles R. Bieyer											
20		)											
21		<del></del>											
22													
23													
24													
25													
26													
27													
28													

SECOND PARTIAL CONSENT DECREE MDL No. 2672 CRB (JSC)

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS 1 2 I. APPLICABILITY..... II. 3 DEFINITIONS 8 III. IV. APPROVAL OF SUBMISSIONS AND EPA/CARB DECISIONS.......17 V. 5 VI. VII. STIPULATED PENALTIES AND ADDITIONAL MITIGATION TRUST 6 7 VIII. IX. 8 X. XI. XII. COSTS 42 10 XIII XIV. 11 XV. 12 XVI. 13 XIX. 14 XX. 15 XXI. FINAL JUDGMENT .......51 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28

WHEREAS, Plaintiff United States of America, on behalf of the United States

Environmental Protection Agency, filed a complaint in this action on January 4, 2016 (as
amended on October 7, 2016), against Volkswagen AG, Volkswagen Group of America, Inc.,

Volkswagen Group of America Chattanooga Operations, LLC, Audi AG, Dr. Ing. h.c. F. Porsche

AG, and Porsche Cars North America, Inc. (together, "Defendants") alleging that Defendants

violated Sections 203(a)(1), (2), (3)(A), and (3)(B) of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C.

§§ 7522(a)(1), (2), (3)(A), and (3)(B), with regard to approximately 500,000 model year 2009 to
2015 motor vehicles containing 2.0 liter diesel engines (more specifically defined elsewhere as

"2.0 Liter Subject Vehicles") and approximately 80,000 model year 2009 to 2016 motor vehicles
containing 3.0 liter diesel engines (more specifically defined elsewhere as "3.0 Liter Subject
Vehicles"), for a total of approximately 580,000 motor vehicles (collectively, "Subject
Vehicles");

WHEREAS, the U.S. Complaint alleges that each Subject Vehicle contains, as part of the engine control module ("ECM"), certain computer algorithms that cause the emissions control system of those vehicles to perform differently during normal vehicle operation and use than during emissions testing. The U.S. Complaint alleges that these computer algorithms are prohibited defeat devices under the Act, and that during normal vehicle operation and use, the Subject Vehicles emit levels of oxides of nitrogen ("NOx") significantly in excess of the EPA-compliant levels. The U.S. Complaint alleges and asserts four claims for relief related to the presence of the defeat devices in the Subject Vehicles;

WHEREAS, the People of the State of California, by and through the California Air Resources Board ("CARB") and Kamala D. Harris, Attorney General of the State of California, filed a complaint on June 27, 2016, against Defendants alleging that Defendants violated Cal.

Health & Safety Code §§ 43016, 43017, 43151, 43152, 43153, 43205, 43211, and 43212; Cal. Code Regs. tit. 13, §§ 1903, 1961, 1961.2, 1965, 1968.2, and 2037, and 40 C.F.R. Sections incorporated by reference in those California regulations; Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code §§ 17200 et seq., 17500 et seq., and 17580.5; Cal. Civ. Code § 3494; and 12 U.S.C. § 5536 et seq., with regard to approximately 71,000 model year 2009 to 2015 motor vehicles containing 2.0 liter diesel engines and approximately 16,000 model year 2009 to 2016 motor vehicles containing 3.0 liter diesel engines, for a total of approximately 87,000 motor vehicles in California. The California Complaint alleges, in relevant part, that the motor vehicles contain prohibited defeat devices and have resulted in, and continue to result in, increased NOx emissions from each such vehicle significantly in excess of CARB requirements, that these vehicles have resulted in the creation of a public nuisance, and that Defendants engaged in related conduct that violated unfair competition, false advertising, and consumer protection laws;

WHEREAS, on June 28, 2016, the United States lodged a Partial Consent Decree, Dkt.

No. 1605-1 ("First Partial Consent Decree"), concerning the 2.0 Liter Subject Vehicles, which was entered into by the United States, California, and certain Defendants (Volkswagen AG, Audi AG, Volkswagen Group of America, Inc., and Volkswagen Group of America Chattanooga Operations, LLC). The First Partial Consent Decree was entered by this Court on October 25, 2016. Dkt. No. 2103;

WHEREAS, the United States and California enter into this Second Partial Consent

Decree with Defendants (collectively, the "Parties") to address the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles on
the road and the associated environmental consequences resulting from the past and future
excess emissions from the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles;

WHEREAS, Defendants admit that software in the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles enables the vehicles' ECMs to detect when the vehicles are being driven on the road, rather than undergoing Federal Test Procedures, and that this software renders certain emission control systems in the vehicles inoperative when the ECM detects the vehicles are not undergoing Federal Test Procedures, resulting in emissions that exceed EPA-compliant and CARB-compliant levels when the vehicles are driven on the road;

WHEREAS, Defendants admit that this software was not disclosed in the Certificate of Conformity and Executive Order applications for the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles, and, as a result, the design specifications of the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles, as manufactured, differ materially from the design specifications described in the Certificate of Conformity and Executive Order applications;

**WHEREAS,** except as expressly provided in this Consent Decree, nothing in this Consent Decree shall constitute an admission of any fact or law by any Party except for the purpose of enforcing the terms or conditions set forth herein;

#### **WHEREAS**, the Parties agree that:

- 1. The 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles on the road emit NOx at levels above the standards to which they were certified to EPA and CARB pursuant to the Clean Air Act and the California Health and Safety Code, and a prompt remedy to address the noncompliance is needed;
- 2. At the present time, there are no practical engineering solutions that would, without negative impact to vehicle functions and unacceptable delay, bring the Generation 1.x 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles into compliance with the exhaust emission standards and the on-board diagnostics requirements to which Defendants certified the vehicles to EPA and CARB.

  Defendants expect there to be a practical engineering solution to bring the Generation 2.x 3.0

Liter Subject Vehicles into compliance with the exhaust emission standards to which Defendants certified the vehicles to EPA and CARB;

- 3. Accordingly, as one element of the remedy to address the Clean Air Act and California Health and Safety Code violations, Defendants are required to perform two vehicle recalls as follows:
  - a. First, for Generation 1.x 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles, Defendants must offer the Buyback or the Lease Termination, for 100% of the Generation 1.x vehicles under terms described in Appendix A of this Consent Decree (Buyback, Lease Termination, Vehicle Modification, and Emissions Compliant Recall Program). In addition, if approved by EPA/CARB, Defendants may, in accordance with the requirements specified in Appendix B of this Consent Decree (Vehicle Recall and Emissions Modification Program for 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles), modify such vehicles to substantially reduce their NOx emissions in accordance with standards established by EPA/CARB in this Consent Decree.
  - b. Second, for Generation 2.x 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles, if proposed by Defendants and approved by EPA/CARB, Defendants must offer an Emissions Compliant Recall as set forth in Appendix A to bring these vehicles into compliance with their Certified Exhaust Emission Standards in accordance with the requirements specified in Appendix B. If Defendants are unable to effect a recall that meets Certified Exhaust Emission Standards for a particular Test Group or Groups of Generation 2.x 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles within the timeframe and in accordance with the other requirements specified in Appendix B, Defendants must offer the Buyback or Lease Termination, under terms described in Appendix

A, for 100% of such vehicles and may, if proposed by Defendants and approved by EPA/CARB, consistent with the provisions in Appendix B, modify such vehicles to substantially reduce their NOx emissions in accordance with standards established by EPA/CARB in this Consent Decree.

- c. In the event Defendants do not achieve the 85% recall rates required by Appendix A, Defendants must pay additional funds into the Mitigation Trust;
- 4. The practical engineering solutions provided by Appendix B, should Defendants propose such emissions modifications consistent with the provisions of Appendix B, would substantially reduce NOx emissions from the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles and improve their onboard diagnostics, would avoid undue waste and potential environmental harm that would be associated with removing the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles from service, and would allow Eligible Owners and Eligible Lessees to retain their Eligible Vehicles;
- 5. Members of the public who are Eligible Owners or Eligible Lessees of Eligible Vehicles will benefit from the relief provided by this Consent Decree;
- 6. As described below, Defendants will pay a total of \$225,000,000 to fund Eligible Mitigation Actions that will reduce emissions of NOx where the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles were, are, or will be operated. The funding for the Eligible Mitigation Actions required by this Consent Decree is intended to fully mitigate the total, lifetime excess NOx emissions from the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles;

**WHEREAS**, the Parties recognize, and the Court by entering this Consent Decree finds, that this Consent Decree has been negotiated by the Parties in good faith and will avoid litigation among the Parties regarding certain relief with respect to the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles for the

claims alleged in the Complaints, and that this Consent Decree is fair, reasonable, and in the public interest; and

WHEREAS, the Parties recognize, and the Court by entering this Consent Decree finds, that the United States and California are not enforcing the laws of other countries, including the emissions laws or regulations of any jurisdiction outside the United States. Nothing in this Consent Decree is intended to apply to, or affect, Defendants' obligations under the laws or regulations of any jurisdiction outside the United States. At the same time, the laws and regulations of other countries shall not affect the Defendants' obligations under this Consent Decree.

NOW, THEREFORE, before the taking of any testimony, without the adjudication of any issue of fact or law, and with the consent of the Parties, IT IS HEREBY ADJUDGED, ORDERED, AND DECREED as follows:

## I. <u>JURISDICTION AND VENUE</u>

1. The Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1345, and 1355, and Sections 203, 204, and 205 of the Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7522, 7523, and 7524, and over the Parties. Venue lies in this District pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1407 and the MDL Panel's Transfer Order, dated December 8, 2015, and filed in this MDL action as Dkt. # 1. The Court has supplemental jurisdiction over the California State law claims pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1367. For purposes of this Decree, Defendants consent to the Court's jurisdiction over this Consent Decree, over any action to enforce this Consent Decree, and over Defendants, and consent to venue in this judicial district. Defendants reserve the right to challenge and oppose any claims to jurisdiction that do not arise from the Court's jurisdiction over this Consent Decree or an action to enforce this Consent Decree.

2. For purposes of this Consent Decree, Defendants agree that the U.S. Complaint states claims upon which relief may be granted pursuant to Sections 203, 204, and 205 of the Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7522, 7523, and 7524, and that the California Complaint states claims upon which relief may be granted pursuant to Cal. Health & Safety Code §§ 43016, 43017, 43151, 43152, 43153, 43205, 43211, and 43212; Cal. Code Regs. tit. 13, §§ 1903, 1961, 1961.2, 1965, 1968.2, and 2037, and 40 C.F.R. Sections incorporated by reference in those California regulations; Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code §§ 17200 et seq., 17500 et seq., and 17580.5; Cal. Civ. Code § 3494; and 12 U.S.C. § 5536 et seq.

#### II. <u>APPLICABILITY</u>

- 3. The obligations of this Consent Decree apply to and are binding upon the United States and California, and upon Defendants and any of Defendants' successors, assigns, or other entities or persons otherwise bound by law.
- 4. With respect to the obligation to perform, pay all costs and warranties associated with, and be liable for all violations of, the emissions modification, lease termination and buyback provisions herein, the Porsche Defendants shall be liable only for the Porsche 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles. The non-Porsche Defendants shall be jointly and severally liable for these obligations with respect to all 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles, including the Porsche 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles. All Defendants shall be jointly and several liable to comply with all other requirements of this Consent Decree, including the Mitigation Trust Payments (Paragraph 17) and the Consequences of Failing to Meet Recall Targets (Appendix A, Paragraph 10.3). In the event of the insolvency of any Defendant or the failure by any Defendant to implement any requirement of this Consent Decree, the remaining Defendants shall complete all such requirements except as set forth in this Paragraph.

- 5. Any legal successor or assign of any Defendant shall assume that Defendant's liability and remain jointly and severally liable for the payment and other performance obligations hereunder for which that Defendant is jointly and severally liable. Defendants shall include an agreement to so remain liable in the terms of any sale, acquisition, merger, or other transaction changing the ownership or control of any of the Defendants, and no change in the ownership or control of any Defendant shall affect the obligations hereunder of any Defendant without modification of the Decree in accordance with Section XVI.
- 6. Defendants shall provide a copy of this Consent Decree to the members of their respective Board of Management and/or Board of Directors and their executives whose duties might reasonably include compliance with any provision of this Decree. Defendants shall condition any contract providing for work required under this Consent Decree to be performed in conformity with the terms thereof. Defendants shall also ensure that any contractors, agents, and employees whose duties might reasonably include compliance with any provision of the Decree are made aware of those requirements of the Decree relevant to their performance.
- 7. In any action to enforce this Consent Decree, Defendants shall not raise as a defense the failure by any of its officers, directors, employees, agents, or contractors to take any actions necessary to comply with the provisions of this Consent Decree.

#### III. DEFINITIONS

8. Terms used in this Consent Decree that are defined in the Act or in regulations promulgated pursuant to the Act shall have the meanings assigned to them in the Act or such regulations, unless otherwise provided in this Decree. Terms that are defined in an Appendix to this Consent Decree have the meaning assigned to them in that Appendix. Whenever the terms set forth below are used in this Consent Decree, the following definitions apply:

"2.0 Liter Subject Vehicles" means each and every light duty diesel vehicle equipped with a 2.0 liter TDI engine that Defendants sold or offered for sale in, or introduced or delivered for introduction into commerce in the United States or its Territories, or imported into the United States or its Territories, and that is or was purported to have been covered by the following EPA Test Groups:

Model Year	EPA Test Group	Vehicle Make and Model(s)
2009	9VWXV02.035N	VW Jetta, VW Jetta Sportwagen
2009	9VWXV02.0U5N	VW Jetta, VW Jetta Sportwagen
2010	AVWXV02.0U5N	VW Golf, VW Jetta, VW Jetta Sportwagen, Audi A3
2011	BVWXV02.0U5N	VW Golf, VW Jetta, VW Jetta Sportwagen, Audi A3
2012	CVWXV02.0U5N	VW Golf, VW Jetta, VW Jetta Sportwagen, Audi A3
2012	CVWXV02.0U4S	VW Passat
2013	DVWXV02.0U5N	VW Beetle, VW Beetle Convertible, VW Golf, VW
		Jetta, VW Jetta Sportwagen, Audi A3
2013	DVWXV02.0U4S	VW Passat
2014	EVWXV02.0U5N	VW Beetle, VW Beetle Convertible, VW Golf, VW
		Jetta, VW Jetta Sportwagen
2014	EVWXV02.0U4S	VW Passat
2015	FVGAV02.0VAL	VW Beetle, VW Beetle Convertible, VW Golf, VW
		Golf Sportwagen, VW Jetta, VW Passat, Audi A3

"3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles" means each and every model year 2009 to 2016 light duty diesel vehicle equipped with a 3.0 liter TDI engine that Defendants sold or offered for sale in, or introduced or delivered for introduction into, commerce in the United States or its Territories, or imported into the United States or its Territories, and that is or was purported to have been covered by the following test groups:

1	Model Year   EPA Test Group(s)		Vehicle Make and Model(s)	Generation					
2	2009	9ADXT03.03LD	VW Touareg, Audi Q7	1.1					
3	2010	AADXT03.03LD	VW Touareg, Audi Q7	1.1					
4	2011	BADXT03.02UG	VW Touareg, Audi Q7	1.2					
5		BADXT03.03UG							
6	2012	CADXT03.02UG	VW Touareg	1.2					
7		CADXT03.03UG	Audi Q7						
	2013	DADXT03.02UG	VW Touareg	2.1 SUV					
8		DADXT03.03UG	Audi Q7						
9		DPRXT03.0CDD	Porsche Cayenne Diesel						
10	2014	EADXT03.02UG	VW Touareg	2.1 SUV					
11		EADXT03.03UG	Audi Q7						
12		EPRXT03.0CDD	Porsche Cayenne Diesel						
13	2014	EADXJ03.04UG	Audi: A6 quattro, A7 quattro,	2 PC					
14			A8, A8L, Q5						
15	2015	FVGAT03.0NU3	Audi: Q7, A6 quattro, A7	2.1 SUV					
16			quattro, A8, A8L, Q5						
17	2015	FVGAT03.0NU2	VW Touareg	2.2 SUV					
18		FPRXT03.0CDD	Porsche Cayenne Diesel						
19	2015	FVGAJ03.0NU4	Audi: A6 quattro, A7 quattro,	2 PC					
20			A8, A8L, Q5						
	2016	GVGAT03.0NU2	VW Touareg	2.2 SUV					
21		GPRXT03.0CDD	Porsche Cayenne Diesel						
22	2016	GVGAJ03.0NU4	Audi: A6 quattro, A7 quattro,	2 PC					
23			A8, A8L, Q5						

25

26

27

28

<sup>&</sup>quot;Approved Emissions Modification" has the meaning set forth in Appendix B;

<sup>&</sup>quot;Buyback" has the meaning set forth in Appendix A;

	"CA AG" means the California Attorney General's Office and any of its successor
depar	tments or agencies;

"California" means the People of the State of California, acting by and through the California Attorney General and the California Air Resources Board;

"California Complaint" means the complaint filed by California in this action;

"CARB" means the California Air Resources Board and any of its successor departments or agencies;

"Certified Exhaust Emissions Standards" has the meaning set forth in Appendix A;

"Clean Air Act" or "Act" means 42 U.S.C. §§ 7401-7671q;

"Complaints" means the U.S. Complaint and the California Complaint;

"Consent Decree" or "Decree" or "Second Partial Consent Decree" means this partial consent decree and all Appendices attached hereto (listed in Section XXII);

"Day" means a calendar day unless expressly stated to be a business day. In computing any period of time under this Consent Decree, where the last day would fall on a Saturday, Sunday, or federal or California holiday, the period shall run until the close of business of the next business day;

"Defendants" means the persons or entities named in the U.S. Complaint and California Complaint, specifically, Volkswagen AG, Volkswagen Group of America, Inc., Volkswagen Group of America Chattanooga Operations, LLC, Audi AG, Dr. Ing. h.c. F. Porsche AG, and Porsche Cars North America, Inc.;

"Effective Date" has the meaning set forth in Section XIV;

"Eligible Lessee" has the meaning set forth in Appendix A;

"Eligible Mitigation Actions" has the meaning se	et forth in Appendix D to the First Partial
Consent Decree;	

- "Eligible Owner" has the meaning set forth in Appendix A;
- "Eligible Vehicle" has the meaning set forth in Appendix A;
- "Emissions Compliant Recall" has the meaning set forth in Appendix A;
- "EPA" means the United States Environmental Protection Agency and any of its successor departments or agencies;

"First Partial Consent Decree" means the Partial Consent Decree entered in this action by the Court on October 25, 2016;

"First California Partial Consent Decree" means the Partial Consent Decree between the California Attorney General and Defendants entered by the Court on September 1, 2016;

"Generation" means the different versions of emission control technology installed in various configurations of 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles. The Generation of each 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicle is specified in the chart set forth in the definition of 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles;

"Generation 1.x 3.0 Liter Eligible Vehicle" and "Generation 2.x 3.0 Liter Eligible Vehicle" have the meanings set forth in Appendix A. The Generations are specified in the chart set forth in the definition of 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles;

"Initial 3.0 Liter Mitigation Allocation Appendix" or "Mitigation Appendix" is the appendix setting forth the initial allocation of Mitigation Trust funds for the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles;

"Lease Termination" has the meaning set forth in Appendix A;

"Materials" means Submissions and other documents, certifications, plans, reports, notifications, data, or other information that is required to be submitted pursuant to this Decree;

	"Mitigation	Trust"	or "	'Trust''	means	the	trust	establis	hed o	r to l	be est	ablis	hed p	ursuai	nt to
Sectio	n IV. and Ap	pendix	Do	of the F	irst Par	tial (	Cons	ent Dec	ree;						

"Mitigation Trust Payment" means any payment required to be paid into the Trust Account;

"Paragraph" means a portion of this Decree identified by an Arabic numeral;

"Parties" means the United States, California, and Defendants;

"Porsche Defendants" means Dr. Ing. h.c. F. Porsche AG, and Porsche Cars North America, Inc.;

"Porsche 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles" means the Porsche vehicles specified in the chart set forth in the definition of 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles;

"Retail Replacement Value" has the meaning set forth in Appendix A;

"Section" means a portion of this Decree identified by a Roman numeral;

"Submission" means any plan, report, guidance, or other item that is required to be submitted for approval pursuant to this Consent Decree;

"Test Group" has the meaning set forth in Appendix B;

"Trust Account" has the meaning set forth in the Trust Agreement;

"Trust Agreement" means a trust agreement in the form set forth in Appendix D to the First Partial Consent Decree, to be entered into by the Defendants and the Trustee selected pursuant to Paragraph 15 of the First Partial Consent Decree;

"Trustee" means the trustee selected for the Mitigation Trust in accordance with Paragraph 15 of the First Partial Consent Decree;

"United States" means the United States of America, acting on behalf of EPA, except when used in subparagraph 75.h, when it shall mean the United States of America; and

"U.S. Complaint" means the complaint filed by the United States in this action on January 4, 2016 (as amended on October 7, 2016).

### IV. PARTIAL INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

Buyback, Lease Termination, Vehicle Modification, and Emissions Compliant Recall Program (Appendix A) and Vehicle Recall and Emissions Modification Program for 3.0 Liter Vehicles (Appendix B)

- 9. Defendants shall implement the Buyback, Lease Termination, Vehicle Modification, and Emissions Compliant Recall Program in accordance with the requirements set forth in Appendix A, together with the Vehicle Recall and Emissions Modification Program for 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles in accordance with the requirements set forth in Appendix B.
- 10. <u>Generation 1.x 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles</u>. As required by Appendix A, by no later than November 30, 2019, Defendants shall remove from commerce in the United States and/or perform an Approved Emissions Modification (in accordance with Appendix B) on at least 85% of the Generation 1.x 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles.
- 11. <u>Generation 2.x 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles</u>. As required by Appendix A, by no later than May 31, 2020, Defendants shall perform an Emissions Compliant Recall (or, if no Emissions Compliant Recall is achieved, remove from commerce in the United States and/or perform an Approved Emissions Modification) on at least 85% of all Generation 2.x 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles.
- 12. Defendants must offer each and every Eligible Owner and Eligible Lessee of a 3.0 Liter Eligible Vehicle for which the offer of the Buyback is required pursuant to Appendix A, the option of the Buyback of the Eligible Vehicle at a price no less than Retail Replacement Value, or the Lease Termination in accordance with the terms specified in Appendix A.
  - 13. In the event Defendants do not achieve these 85% recall rates, Defendants shall

pay additional funds into the Mitigation Trust as set forth in Appendix A.

- 14. If Defendants implement an Emissions Compliant Recall or a vehicle recall and Approved Emissions Modification for any 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicle, approval and implementation of that modification shall be governed by Appendices A and B.
- 15. Defendants shall not sell or cause to be sold, or lease or cause to be leased, any 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicle, except as provided in Appendices A and B. Defendants shall not modify or cause to be modified any emission control system or emissions aftertreatment or any other software or hardware that affects the emission control system on any 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicle except in compliance with Appendices A and B.
- 16. Except as otherwise provided in Appendices A and B, Defendants may not export from the United States to another country any 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicle.

# Mitigation of Excess Emissions and Mitigation Trust (First Partial Consent Decree, Appendix D)

- 17. <u>Payment of Mitigation Funds</u>.
  - a. <u>Mitigation Trust Payment</u>. Not later than 30 Days after the Effective Date, Defendants shall deposit \$225,000,000 in Mitigation Trust Payments into the Trust Account to be used to fund Eligible Mitigation Actions to achieve reductions of NOx emissions in accordance with the Trust Agreement.
  - b. <u>Mitigation Trust Payments under Appendices A and B</u>. All Mitigation Trust Payments required by Appendices A and B shall be deposited into the Trust Account.
  - c. Notice of Trust Payments. Defendants shall notify the Trustee and the United States and CARB by mail and email in accordance with the requirements of Section XIII (Notices) on the Day any such Mitigation Trust

6

8

10

11

13

12

1415

16

17

18 19

20

21

2223

24

2526

27

28

Payments are made.

d. Court Registry. If any payments required under this Paragraph 17 become due before the Trust Account is established, Defendants shall deposit such payments with the Court in accordance with Fed. R. Civ. P. 67. Defendants shall execute such documents and support such actions as necessary to facilitate the deposit of payments with the Court. For purposes of Fed. R. Civ. P. 67, this Consent Decree constitutes an order permitting such deposits and authorizing the Clerk of Court for the Northern District of California: (1) to accept an electronic funds transfer payment from Defendants of any payments required under this Paragraph 17; and (2) to hold such funds in the Clerk's Registry, including interest earned thereon, pending the further order of this Court. For purposes of 28 U.S.C. § 2042, this Consent Decree constitutes an order permitting the Trustee, upon filing a designation and identification of Trust Account as required by Appendix D to the First Partial Consent Decree, to withdraw all such funds, including all accrued interest, for immediate and concurrent deposit into the Trust Account. In the event that the United States determines that the funds cannot be deposited in accordance with Fed. R. Civ. P. 67, and unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Parties, the Defendants shall hold the funds in an interest-bearing escrow account, for deposit (together with all accrued interest) into the Trust Account when established.

18. <u>Modification of Appendix D (Form of Environmental Mitigation Trust</u>

<u>Agreement) and Appendix D-3 (Certification for Beneficiary Status under Environmental</u>

<u>Mitigation Trust Agreement) to the First Partial Consent Decree</u>. Upon the Effective Date of the

Second Partial Consent Decree, the Parties agree to make non-material modifications to Appendix D and Appendix D-3 of the First Partial Consent Decree as follows to enable the Mitigation Payments from this Consent Decree to be placed in the Mitigation Trust created pursuant to the First Partial Consent Decree: (1) all references to 2.0 Liter Subject Vehicles will also include 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles; (2) all references to Appendix D-1 will also include the Mitigation Appendix; (3) most references to Consent Decree will include both the First and Second Partial Consent Decrees; and (4) most references to Settling Defendants will also include Defendants.

- 19. <u>Mitigation Appendix</u>. The Mitigation Appendix, attached to this Second Partial Consent Decree, sets forth an initial allocation of Mitigation Trust funds for the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles for entities that may seek to become a Beneficiary under the Trust Agreement.
- 20. <u>Modification of Trust Agreement and its Appendices</u>. After the Trust is established pursuant to Paragraph 17 of the First Partial Consent Decree, the Trust may be modified only in accordance with Paragraph 19 of the First Partial Consent Decree.

# V. APPROVAL OF SUBMISSIONS AND EPA/CARB DECISIONS

- 21. For purposes of this Consent Decree, unless otherwise specified in this Consent Decree:
  - a. with respect to any Submission, other obligation, or force majeure claim of Defendants concerning Appendix B, EPA and CARB, or the United States and California as applicable, will issue a joint decision concerning the Submission, other obligation, or force majeure claim; and
  - b. with respect to any other Submission, obligation, or force majeure claim of Defendants under the Consent Decree, the position of EPA or the United

States, after consultation with CARB or California, as applicable, shall control.

- 22. For purposes of this Section, Section VII (Stipulated Penalties and Other Mitigation Trust Payments), Section VIII (Force Majeure), and Section IX (Dispute Resolution), in accordance with the decision-making authorities set forth in Paragraph 21, references to "EPA/CARB" mean EPA and CARB jointly, or EPA or CARB, as applicable; references to "the United States/California" mean the United States and California jointly, or the United States or California, as applicable; and references to the United States/CARB mean the United States/CARB jointly, or the United States or CARB, as applicable.
- 23. Any specific procedures or specifications for the review of Submissions set forth in the Appendices shall govern, as applicable, the review of any Submission submitted pursuant to such Appendix. Except as otherwise specified in the Appendices, after review of any Submission, EPA/CARB shall in writing: (a) approve the Submission; (b) approve the Submission upon specified conditions; (c) approve part of the Submission and disapprove the remainder; or (d) disapprove the Submission. In the event of disapproval, in full or in part, of any portion of the Submission, if not already provided with the disapproval, upon the request of Defendants, EPA/CARB will provide in writing the reasons for such disapproval.
- 24. If the Submission is approved pursuant to Paragraph 23, Defendants shall take all actions required by the Submission in accordance with the schedules and requirements of the Submission, as approved. If the Submission is conditionally approved or approved only in part pursuant to subparagraph 23(b) or (c), Defendants shall, upon written direction from EPA/CARB, take all actions required by the Submission that EPA/CARB determine(s) are technically severable from any disapproved portions.
  - 25. If the Submission is disapproved in whole or in part pursuant to subparagraph

23(c) or (d), Defendants shall, within 30 Days or such other time as provided by an Appendix or as the Parties agree to in writing, correct all deficiencies and resubmit the Submission, or disapproved portion thereof, for approval, in accordance with Paragraphs 23 and 24. If the resubmission is approved in whole or in part, Defendants shall proceed in accordance with Paragraph 24.

26. If a resubmitted Submission, or portion thereof, is disapproved in whole or in part,

- 26. If a resubmitted Submission, or portion thereof, is disapproved in whole or in part, EPA/CARB may again require Defendants to correct any deficiencies, in accordance with Paragraphs 24 and 25, or EPA/CARB may itself/themselves correct any deficiencies.
- 27. Defendants may elect to invoke the dispute resolution procedures set forth in Section IX (Dispute Resolution) concerning any decision of EPA/CARB to disapprove, approve on specified conditions, or modify a Submission. If Defendants elect to invoke dispute resolution, they shall do so within 30 Days (or such other time as the Parties agree to in writing) after receipt of the applicable decision.
- 28. Any stipulated penalties applicable to the original Submission, as provided in Section VII (Stipulated Penalties and Other Mitigation Trust Payments), shall accrue during the 30-Day period or other specified period pursuant to Paragraph 25. Such stipulated penalties shall not be payable unless the resubmission of the Submission is untimely or is disapproved in whole or in part; provided that, if the original Submission was so deficient as to constitute a material breach of Defendants' obligations under this Decree in making that Submission, the stipulated penalties applicable to the original Submission shall be due and payable notwithstanding any subsequent resubmission.

# VI. REPORTING AND CERTIFICATION REQUIREMENTS

29. <u>Timing of Reports</u>. Unless otherwise specified in this Consent Decree, or the

Parties otherwise agree in writing:

a. To the extent quarterly reporting is required by this Decree,

Defendants shall submit each report one month after the end of the calendar
quarter, and the report shall cover the prior calendar quarter. That is, reports shall
be submitted on April 30, July 31, October 31, and January 31 for the prior
respective calendar quarter (*i.e.*, the report submitted on April 30 covers January 1
through March 31), as further specified, and covering the items specified,
elsewhere in the Consent Decree.

b. To the extent semi-annual or annual reporting is required,

Defendants shall submit each report one month after the end of the applicable

prior 6-month or annual calendar period, *i.e.*, April 30, July 31, October 31, or

January 31, as applicable, and as further specified, and covering the items

specified, elsewhere in the Consent Decree.

30. Defendants may assert that information submitted under this Consent Decree is protected as Confidential Business Information ("CBI") as set out in 40 C.F.R. pt. 2 or Cal. Code Regs. tit. 17, §§ 91000 to 91022.

## 31. Reporting of Violations

a. Except to the extent the Appendices specify different timeframes or notice recipients, if Defendants reasonably believe they have violated, or that they may violate, any requirement of this Consent Decree, Defendants shall notify EPA, CARB, and CA AG of such violation and its likely duration, in a written report submitted within 10 business days after the Day Defendants first reasonably believe that a violation has occurred or may occur, with an explanation of the

violation's likely cause and of the remedial steps taken, or to be taken, to prevent or minimize such violation. If Defendants believe the cause of a violation cannot be fully explained at the time the report is due, Defendants shall so state in the report. Defendants shall investigate the cause of the violation and shall then submit an amendment to the report, including a full explanation of the cause of the violation, within 30 Days after the Day on which Defendants reasonably believe they have determined the cause of the violation. Nothing in this Paragraph or the following Paragraph relieves Defendants of their obligation to provide the notice required by Section VIII (Force Majeure).

- b. <u>Semi-Annual Report of Violations</u>. On January 31 and July 31 of each year, Defendants shall submit a summary to the United States and California of any violations of the Decree that occurred during the preceding six months (or potentially shorter period for the first semi-annual report), and that are required to be reported pursuant to subparagraph 31.a, including the date of the violation, the date the notice of violation was sent, and a brief description of the violation.
- 32. Whenever Defendants reasonably believe that any violation of this Consent Decree or any other event affecting Defendants' performance under this Decree may pose an immediate threat to the public health or welfare or the environment, Defendants shall notify EPA and California by email as soon as practicable, but no later than 24 hours after Defendants first reasonably believe the violation or event has occurred. This procedure is in addition to the requirements set forth in Paragraph 31.
- 33. All plans, reports, and other information required to be posted to a public website by this Consent Decree shall be accessible on the public website that Defendants use to

administer the Claims Program pursuant to Appendix A-1 (or the analogous website used by Defendants pursuant to a Parallel Agreement under Appendix A-1), and a link to such website shall be displayed on www.vw.com, www.audiusa.com, and www.porsche.com.

34. Each report or other item that is required by an Appendix to be certified pursuant to this Paragraph shall be signed by an officer or director of Defendants and shall include the following sworn certification, which may instead be certified as provided in 28 U.S.C. § 1746:

I certify under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States and California that this document and all attachments were prepared under my direction or supervision in accordance with a system designed to assure that qualified personnel properly gather and evaluate the information submitted. Based on my inquiry of the person or persons who manage the system, or those persons directly responsible for gathering the information, the information submitted is, to the best of my knowledge and belief, true, correct, and complete. I have no personal knowledge, information or belief that the information submitted is other than true, correct, and complete. I am aware that there are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fine and imprisonment for knowing violations.

- 35. Defendants agree that the certification required by Paragraph 34 is subject to 18 U.S.C. §§ 1001(a) and 1621, and California Penal Code §§ 115, 118, and 132.
- 36. The certification requirement in Paragraph 34 does not apply to emergency or similar notifications where compliance would be impractical.
- 37. The reporting requirements of this Consent Decree do not relieve Defendants of any reporting obligations required by the Act or implementing regulations, or by any other federal, state, or local law, regulation, permit, or other requirement.
- 38. Any information provided pursuant to this Consent Decree may be used by the United States or California in any proceeding to enforce the provisions of this Consent Decree and as otherwise permitted by law.

# VII. STIPULATED PENALTIES AND ADDITIONAL MITIGATION TRUST PAYMENTS

- 39. Defendants shall be liable for stipulated penalties and additional Mitigation Trust Payments (collectively, "stipulated payments") to the United States and California for violations of this Consent Decree as specified in this Section and the Appendices, unless excused under Section VIII (Force Majeure). A violation includes failing to perform any obligation required by the terms of this Decree, including any work plan or schedule approved under this Decree, according to all applicable requirements of this Decree and within the specified time schedules established by or approved under this Decree.
- 40. <u>Partial Injunctive Relief Requirements: Appendices A and B</u>. The stipulated payments and other remedies for violations of requirements of Appendices A and B are set forth in those Appendices.
- 41. Partial Injunctive Relief Requirements: Section IV, Paragraph 17 (Payment of Mitigation Funds). The following additional Mitigation Trust Payments shall accrue for each day that the Mitigation Trust Payment of \$225,000,000 required by subparagraph 17.a is late:

Interest (per Par. 44) 1st through 4th Day \$50,000 5th through 30th Day \$100,000 31st through 45th Day \$200,000 46th Day and beyond

a. The additional Mitigation Trust Payments required by this

Paragraph 41 are in addition to the Payment required by subparagraph 17.a, which

Payment shall not be reduced on account of the payment of additional Mitigation

Trust Payments.

b. In the event that no Trust Account has been established as of the

date that any additional Mitigation Trust Payment required pursuant to this

Paragraph 41 becomes due, such payment shall be made into the Court Registry

account in accordance with subparagraph 17.d.

## 42. Reporting and Certification Requirements: Section VI

a. Reporting of Violations. The following stipulated penalties shall accrue per violation per Day for each violation of the requirements of Paragraph 31 (Reporting of Violations):

\$2,000 1st through 14th Day \$5,000 15th through 30th Day \$10,000 31st Day and beyond

b. <u>Certification Requirements</u>. The following stipulated penalties shall accrue per violation per Day for each violation of the certification requirements of Paragraph 34, except for false statements as described in subparagraph 42.c, below, in which case the stipulated penalty shall be the higher of the penalty provided for here in subparagraph 42.b or in subparagraph 42.c:

\$10,000 1st through 14th Day \$25,000 15th through 30th Day \$50,000 31st Day and beyond

- c. <u>False Statements</u>. Defendants shall pay a stipulated penalty of \$1,000,000 for each report or Submission required to be submitted pursuant to this Consent Decree that contains a knowingly false, fictitious, or fraudulent statement or representation of material fact.
- 43. Stipulated payments under this Section shall begin to accrue on the Day after performance is due or on the Day a violation occurs, whichever is applicable, and shall continue

to accrue until performance is satisfactorily completed or until the violation ceases. Stipulated payments shall accrue simultaneously for separate violations of this Consent Decree.

44. If Defendants fail to pay stipulated penalties or the Mitigation Trust Payments required by subparagraphs 17.a (Mitigation Trust Payment) and .b (Mitigation Trust Payments under Appendices A and B) according to the terms of this Consent Decree, Defendants shall be liable for interest on such payments at the rate provided for in 28 U.S.C. § 1961, accruing as of the date payment became due and continuing until payment has been made in full. Nothing in this Paragraph shall be construed to limit the United States or California from seeking any remedy otherwise provided by law for Defendants' failure to pay any stipulated payments.

#### 45. Stipulated Payment Demands and Payments

a. The United States, in consultation with CARB, will issue any demand for stipulated Mitigation Trust Payments required by Paragraph 41 and Appendix B and for stipulated penalties required by this Consent Decree, except that CARB may issue a separate demand for a stipulated penalty pursuant to Appendix A, Paragraph 12.2.7 based on Defendants' failure to make an additional California Mitigation Trust Payment required under Appendix A, Paragraphs 10.3.2, 10.3.4 and 10.4.

b. For the stipulated payments set forth in Paragraph 45.a, Defendants shall pay stipulated penalties to the United States/CARB and stipulated Mitigation Trust Payments to the Mitigation Trust within 30 Days after a written demand by the United States or CARB, as applicable, unless Defendants invoke the dispute resolution procedures under Section IX (Dispute Resolution) within the 30-Day period. Except as provided in Appendix B, Defendants shall pay 75% percent of

the total stipulated penalty amount due to the United States and 25% percent to CARB.

- c. Stipulated Mitigation Trust Payments required by Appendix A,
   Paragraphs 10.3 and 10.4 shall be paid as set forth therein.
- 46. Either the United States or CARB may, in the unreviewable exercise of its discretion, reduce or waive stipulated penalties otherwise due it under this Consent Decree. However, no action by either the United States or CARB may reduce or waive stipulated penalties due to the other.
- 47. Stipulated payments shall continue to accrue as provided in Paragraph 43 during any Dispute Resolution, but need not be paid until the following:
  - a. If the dispute is resolved by agreement of the Parties or by a decision of EPA/CARB that is not appealed to the Court, Defendants shall pay accrued stipulated payments determined to be owing, together with interest as provided in Paragraph 44, to the United States/CARB/the Mitigation Trust, as applicable, within 30 Days after the effective date of the agreement or the receipt of EPA's/CARB's decision or order.
  - b. If the dispute is appealed to the Court and the United States/California prevail(s) in whole or in part, Defendants shall pay all accrued payments determined by the Court to be owing, together with interest as provided in Paragraph 44, to the United States/CARB/the Mitigation Trust within 60 Days after receiving the Court's decision or order, except as provided in subparagraph c, below.
    - c. If any Party appeals the District Court's decision, Defendants shall

pay to the United States/CARB/the Mitigation Trust all accrued payments determined to be owing, together with interest as provided in Paragraph 44, within 15 Days after receiving the final appellate court decision.

48. Defendants shall pay stipulated penalties owing to the United States by FedWire Electronic Funds Transfer ("EFT") to the DOJ account, in accordance with instructions provided to Defendants by the Financial Litigation Unit ("FLU") of the United States Attorney's Office for the Northern District of California after the Effective Date. The payment instructions provided by the FLU will include a Consolidated Debt Collection System ("CDCS") number, which Defendants shall use to identify all payments required to be made in accordance with this Consent Decree. The FLU will provide the payment instructions to:

Head of Treasury of Volkswagen AG Joerg Boche Joerg.boche@volkswagen.de 011-49-5361-92-4184

on behalf of Defendants. Defendants may change the individual to receive payment instructions on their behalf by providing written notice of such change to the United States and CARB in accordance with Section XIII (Notices).

49. Defendants shall pay stipulated penalties owing to CARB by check, accompanied by a Payment Transmittal Form (which CARB will provide to the addressee listed in Paragraph 48 after the Effective Date), with each check mailed to:

Air Resources Board, Accounting Branch P.O. Box 1436 Sacramento, CA 95812-1436;

or by wire transfer, in which case Defendants shall use the following wire transfer information and send the Payment Transmittal Form to the above address prior to each wire transfer:

State of California Air Resources Board c/o Bank of America, Inter Branch to 0148 Routing No. 0260-0959-3 Account No. 01482-80005 Notice of Transfer: Yogeeta Sharma Fax: (916) 322-9612 Reference: ARB Case # MSES-15-085.

Defendants are responsible for any bank charges incurred for processing wire transfers. Except as otherwise provided by this Consent Decree, stipulated penalties paid to CARB shall be deposited into the Air Pollution Control Fund and used by CARB to carry out its duties and functions.

- 50. At the time of payment, Defendants shall send notice that a stipulated payment has been made: (i) to EPA via email at cinwd\_acctsreceivable@epa.gov or via regular mail at EPA Cincinnati Finance Office, 26 W. Martin Luther King Drive, Cincinnati, Ohio 45268; (ii) to DOJ via email or regular mail in accordance with Section XIII; and/or (iii) to CARB via email or regular mail in accordance with Section XIII. Such notice shall state that the payment is for stipulated penalties or Mitigation Trust Payments, as applicable, owed pursuant to the Consent Decree in *In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Marketing, Sales Practices, and Products Liability Litigation*, and shall state for which violation(s) the stipulated payments are being paid. Such notice shall also reference MDL No. 2672 CRB (JSC), CDCS Number and DOJ # 90-5-2-1-11386.
- 51. Defendants shall not deduct any stipulated penalties paid under this Decree pursuant to this Section in calculating their income taxes due to federal, state, or local taxing authorities in the United States.
- 52. The payment of stipulated payments and interest, if any, shall not alter in any way Defendants' obligation to complete the performance of the requirements of this Consent Decree.
  - 53. <u>Non-Exclusivity of Remedy</u>. Stipulated payments and other remedies provided for

in the Consent Decree are not the United States' or California's exclusive remedy for violations of this Consent Decree, including violations of the Consent Decree that are also violations of law. Subject to the provisions in Section XI (Effect of Settlement/Reservation of Rights), the United States and California reserve all legal and equitable remedies available to enforce the provisions of this Consent Decree. In addition to the remedies specifically reserved and those specifically agreed to elsewhere in this Consent Decree, the United States and California expressly reserve the right to seek any other relief they deem appropriate for Defendants' violation of this Consent Decree, including but not limited to an action against Defendants for statutory penalties where applicable, additional injunctive relief, mitigation or offset measures, contempt, and/or criminal sanctions. However, the amount of any statutory penalty assessed for a violation of this Consent Decree (and payable to the United States or to California, respectively) shall be reduced by an amount equal to the amount of any stipulated penalty assessed and paid pursuant to this Consent Decree (to the United States or to California, respectively) for the same violation.

## VIII. <u>FORCE MAJEU</u>RE

54. "Force majeure," for purposes of this Consent Decree, is defined as any event arising from causes beyond the control of Defendants, of any entity controlled by Defendants, or of Defendants' contractors, that delays or prevents the performance of any obligation under this Consent Decree despite Defendants' best efforts to fulfill the obligation. The requirement that Defendants exercise "best efforts to fulfill the obligation" includes using best efforts to anticipate any potential force majeure event and best efforts to address the effects of any potential force majeure event (a) as it is occurring, and (b) following the potential force majeure, such that the delay and any adverse effects of the delay are minimized. "Force majeure" does not include

Defendants' financial inability to perform any obligation under this Consent Decree.

- 55. If any event occurs or has occurred that may delay the performance of any obligation under this Consent Decree, for which Defendants intend or may intend to assert a claim of force majeure, whether or not caused by a force majeure event, Defendants shall provide notice by email to EPA and CARB, within 7 Days of when Defendants first knew that the event might cause a delay. Within 14 Days thereafter, Defendants shall provide in writing to EPA and CARB an explanation and description of the reasons for the delay; the anticipated duration of the delay; all actions taken or to be taken to prevent or minimize the delay or the effect of the delay; a schedule for implementation of any such measures; Defendants' rationale for attributing such delay to a force majeure event if it intends to assert such a claim; and a statement as to whether, in the opinion of Defendants, such event may cause or contribute to an endangerment to public health, welfare or the environment. Defendants shall include with any notice all available documentation supporting the claim that the delay was attributable to a force majeure event. Failure to comply with the above requirements shall preclude Defendants from asserting any claim of force majeure for that event for the period of time of such failure to comply, and for any additional delay caused by such failure. Defendants shall be deemed to know of any circumstance of which Defendants, any entity controlled by Defendants, or Defendants' contractors knew or should have known.
- 56. If EPA/CARB agree(s) that the delay or anticipated delay is attributable to a force majeure event, the time for performance of the obligations under this Consent Decree that are affected by the force majeure event will be extended by EPA/CARB for such time as is necessary to complete those obligations. An extension of the time for performance of the obligations affected by the force majeure event shall not, of itself, extend the time for

performance of any other obligation. EPA/CARB will notify Defendants in writing of the length of the extension, if any, for performance of the obligations affected by the force majeure event.

- 57. If EPA/CARB do(es) not agree that the delay or anticipated delay has been or will be caused by a force majeure event, EPA/CARB will notify Defendants in writing of its/their decision.
- 58. If Defendants elect to invoke the dispute resolution procedures set forth in Section IX (Dispute Resolution), it shall do so no later than 15 Days after receipt of EPA's/CARB's notice. In any such proceeding, Defendants shall have the burden of demonstrating by a preponderance of the evidence that the delay or anticipated delay has been or will be caused by a force majeure event, that the duration of the delay or the extension sought was or will be warranted under the circumstances, that best efforts were exercised to avoid and mitigate the effects of the delay, and that Defendants complied with the requirements of Paragraphs 54 and 55. If Defendants carry this burden, the delay at issue shall be deemed not to be a violation by Defendants of the affected obligation of this Consent Decree identified to EPA/CARB and the Court.

#### IX. DISPUTE RESOLUTION

- 59. Unless otherwise expressly provided for in this Consent Decree, the dispute resolution procedures of this Section shall be the exclusive mechanism to resolve disputes arising under or with respect to this Consent Decree. Failure by the Defendants to seek resolution of a dispute under this Section shall preclude Defendants from raising any such issue as a defense to an action by the United States or California to enforce any obligation of Defendants arising under this Decree.
  - 60. <u>Informal Dispute Resolution</u>. Any dispute subject to dispute resolution under this

Consent Decree shall first be the subject of informal negotiations. The dispute shall be considered to have arisen when Defendants send the United States and California by mail a written Notice of Dispute. Such Notice of Dispute shall state clearly the matter in dispute, including, where applicable, whether the dispute arises from a decision made by EPA and CARB jointly, or EPA or CARB individually. The period of informal negotiations shall not exceed 30 Days after the date the dispute arises, unless that period is modified by written agreement. If the Parties cannot resolve a dispute by informal negotiations, then the position advanced by the United States/California shall be considered binding unless, within 30 Days after the conclusion of the informal negotiation period, Defendants invoke formal dispute resolution procedures as set forth below.

- 61. <u>Formal Dispute Resolution</u>. Defendants shall invoke formal dispute resolution procedures, within the time period provided in the preceding Paragraph, by serving on the United States/California a written Statement of Position regarding the matter in dispute. The Statement of Position shall include, but need not be limited to, any factual data, analysis, or opinion supporting Defendants' position and any supporting documentation relied upon by Defendants.
- 62. The United States/California will serve its/their Statement of Position within 45

  Days after receipt of Defendants' Statement of Position. The United States'/California's

  Statement of Position will include, but need not be limited to, any factual data, analysis, or opinion supporting that position and any supporting documentation relied upon by the United States/California. The United States'/California's Statement of Position shall be binding on Defendants, unless Defendants file a motion for judicial review of the dispute in accordance with Paragraph 63.
  - 63. Defendants may seek judicial review of the dispute by filing with the Court and

serving on the United States/California, in accordance with Section XIII (Notices), a motion requesting judicial resolution of the dispute. The motion must be filed within 20 Days after receipt of the United States'/California's Statement of Position pursuant to the preceding Paragraph. The motion shall contain a written statement of Defendants' position on the matter in dispute, including any supporting factual data, analysis, opinion, or documentation, and shall set forth the relief requested and any schedule within which the dispute must be resolved for orderly implementation of the Consent Decree.

64. The United States/California will respond to Defendants' motion within the time period allowed by the Local Rules of the Court. Defendants may file a reply memorandum, to the extent permitted by the Local Rules.

#### 65. <u>Standard of Review for Judicial Disputes</u>

a. Disputes Concerning Matters Accorded Record Review. In any dispute arising under Appendix B and brought pursuant to Paragraph 63,

Defendants shall have the burden of demonstrating that EPA's/CARB's action or determination or position is arbitrary and capricious or otherwise not in accordance with law based on the administrative record. For purposes of this subparagraph, EPA/CARB will maintain an administrative record of the dispute, which will contain all statements of position, including supporting documentation, submitted pursuant to this Section. Prior to the filing of any motion, the Parties may submit additional materials to be part of the administrative record pursuant to applicable principles of administrative law.

b. Other Disputes. Except as otherwise provided in this Consent

Decree, in any other dispute brought pursuant to Paragraph 63, Defendants shall

bear the burden of demonstrating by a preponderance of the evidence that their actions were in compliance with this Consent Decree.

- 66. In any disputes brought under this Section, it is hereby expressly acknowledged and agreed that this Consent Decree was jointly drafted in good faith by the United States, California, and Defendants. Accordingly, the Parties hereby agree that any and all rules of construction to the effect that ambiguity is construed against the drafting party shall be inapplicable in any dispute concerning the terms, meaning, or interpretation of this Consent Decree.
- 67. The invocation of dispute resolution procedures under this Section shall not, by itself, extend, postpone, or affect in any way any obligation of Defendants under this Consent Decree, unless and until final resolution of the dispute so provides. Stipulated penalties with respect to the disputed matter shall continue to accrue from the first Day of noncompliance, but payment shall be stayed pending resolution of the dispute as provided in Paragraph 47. If Defendants do not prevail on the disputed issue, stipulated payments shall be assessed and paid as provided in Section VII (Stipulated Penalties and Other Mitigation Trust Payments).

## X. <u>INFORMATION COLLECTION AND RETENTION</u>

- 68. The United States, California, and their representatives, including attorneys, contractors, and consultants, shall have the right of entry, upon presentation of credentials, at all reasonable times into any of Defendants' offices, plants, or facilities:
  - a. to monitor the progress of activities required under this Consent
     Decree;
  - b. to verify any data or information submitted to the United States or California in accordance with the terms of this Consent Decree;

1	c. to inspect records related to this Consent Decree;		
2	d. to conduct testing related to this Consent Decree;		
3	e. to obtain documentary evidence, including photographs and simil		
4	data, related to this Consent Decree;		
5			
6	f. to assess Defendants' compliance with this Consent Decree; and		
7	g. for other purposes as set forth in 42 U.S.C. § 7542(b) and Cal.		
8	Gov't Code § 11180.		
9	69. Upon request, and for purposes of evaluating compliance with the Consent Decree		
10 11	Defendants shall promptly provide to EPA and California or their authorized representatives at		
12	locations to be designated by EPA and California:		
13	a. vehicles, in specified configurations, for emissions testing;		
14	b. engine control units for vehicles of specified configurations;		
15	c. specified software and related documentation for vehicles of		
16			
17	specified configurations;		
18	d. reasonable requests for English translations of software		
19	documents; or		
20	e. other items or information that could be requested pursuant to 42		
21	U.S.C. § 7542(a) or Cal. Gov't Code § 11180.		
22   23	70. Until three years after the termination of this Consent Decree, Defendants shall		
24	retain, and shall instruct their contractors and agents to preserve, all non-identical copies of all		
25			
26	documents, records, reports, or other information (including documents, records, or other		
27	information in electronic form) (hereinafter referred to as "Records") in their or their contractors		
28	or agents' possession or control, or that come into their or their contractors' or agents' possession		
	35		
	]		

or control, relating to Defendants' performance of their obligations under this Consent Decree, except that Defendants are not required to retain copies or images of military identification cards to the extent that retention of such copies or images would violate 18 U.S.C. § 701. This information-retention requirement shall apply regardless of any contrary corporate or institutional policies or procedures. At any time during this information-retention period, upon request by the United States or California, Defendants shall provide copies of any Records required to be maintained under this Paragraph, notwithstanding any limitation or requirement imposed by foreign laws. Nothing in this Paragraph shall apply to any documents in the possession, custody, or control of any outside legal counsel retained by Defendants in connection with this Consent Decree or of any contractors or agents retained by such outside legal counsel solely to assist in the legal representation of Defendants. Defendants may assert that certain Records are privileged or protected as provided under federal or California law. If Defendants assert such a privilege or protection, they shall provide the following: (a) the title of the Record; (b) the date of the Record; (c) the name and title of each author of the Record; (d) the name and title of each addressee and recipient; (e) a description of the subject of the Record; and (f) the privilege or protection asserted by Defendants. However, Defendants may make no claim of privilege or protection regarding: (1) any data regarding the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles or compliance with this Consent Decree; or (2) the portion of any Record that Defendants are required to create or generate pursuant to this Consent Decree.

71. At the conclusion of the information-retention period provided in the preceding Paragraph, Defendants shall notify the United States and California at least 90 Days prior to the destruction of any Records subject to the requirements of the preceding Paragraph and, upon request by the United States or California, Defendants shall deliver any such Records to EPA or

California. Defendants may assert that certain Records are privileged or protected as provided under federal or California law. If Defendants assert such a privilege or protection, they shall provide the following: (a) the title of the Record; (b) the date of the Record; (c) the name and title of each author of the Record; (d) the name and title of each addressee and recipient; (e) a description of the subject of the Record; and (f) the privilege or protection asserted by Defendants. However, Defendants may make no claim of privilege or protection regarding: (1) any data regarding the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles or compliance with this Consent Decree; or (2) the portion of any Record that Defendants are required to create or generate pursuant to this Consent Decree.

- 72. Defendants may also assert that information required to be provided under this Section is protected as CBI as defined in Paragraph 30. As to any information that Defendants seek to protect as CBI, Defendants shall follow the procedures set forth in 40 C.F.R. pt. 2 or equivalent California law.
- 73. This Consent Decree in no way limits or affects any right of entry and inspection, or any right to obtain information, held by the United States or California pursuant to applicable federal or state laws, regulations, or permits, nor does it limit or affect any duty or obligation of Defendants to maintain Records imposed by applicable federal or state laws, regulations, or permits.

#### XI. <u>EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT/RESERVATION OF RIGHTS</u>

74. Satisfaction of all the requirements of this Second Partial Consent Decree (and, as to California, satisfaction of all the requirements of this Second Partial Consent Decree and the concurrently lodged Second California Partial Consent Decree) shall resolve and settle all of the United States' and California's civil claims in the Complaints for injunctive relief, based on facts

that were disclosed by Defendants to EPA and CARB prior to October 24, 2016, relating to any defeat devices or auxiliary emission control devices ("AECDs") in the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles, that they made or could have made against Defendants:

- a. requiring Defendants to take action to buy back, recall, or modify the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles in order to remedy the violations alleged in the Complaints concerning the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles;
- b. requiring Defendants to make payments to owners and lessees of the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles in order to remedy the violations alleged in the Complaints concerning the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles; and
- c. requiring Defendants to mitigate the environmental harm associated with the violations alleged in the Complaints concerning the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles.
- 75. The United States reserves, and this Second Partial Consent Decree is without prejudice to, all claims, rights, and remedies against Defendants with respect to all matters not expressly resolved in Paragraph 74. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Decree, the United States reserves all claims, rights, and remedies against Defendants with respect to:
  - a. Further injunctive relief, including prohibitory and mandatory injunctive provisions intended to enjoin, prevent, and deter future violations of the Act of the types alleged in the U.S. Complaint related to the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles;
  - b. All rights to address noncompliance with Appendix B as set forth in Paragraph 8.1 of Appendix B;
    - c. All rights reserved by Paragraph 53;

- d. Civil penalties with respect to the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles;
- e. Any and all civil claims related to any 2.0 Liter Subject Vehicles, but only to the extent not previously resolved under the First Partial Consent Decree, or to any other vehicle other than the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles;
- f. Any and all civil claims and administrative authorities for injunctive relief: (i) based on facts that were not disclosed by Defendants to EPA and CARB prior to October 24, 2016, related to any defeat devices or AECDs installed on or in the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles; or (ii) related to any other failures by the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles to conform with the Act or its implementing regulations;
  - g. Any criminal liability; and
- h. Any claim(s) of any agency of the United States, other than EPA, including but not limited to claims by the Federal Trade Commission.
- 76. California reserves, and this Second Partial Consent Decree is without prejudice to, all claims, rights, and remedies against Defendants with respect to all matters not expressly resolved in Paragraph 74. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Decree, California reserves all claims, rights, and remedies against Defendants with respect to:
  - a. An order requiring Defendants to take all actions necessary to enjoin, prevent, and deter future violations of the Health and Safety Code and related regulations of the types alleged in the California Complaint related to the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles;
  - b. Further injunctive relief, including prohibitory and mandatory injunctive provisions intended to enjoin, prevent, and deter future misconduct,

and/or incentivize its detection, disclosure, and/or prosecution; or to enjoin false advertising, violation of environmental laws, the making of false statements, or the use or employment of any practice that constitutes unfair competition;

- c. All rights to address noncompliance with Appendix B as set forth in Appendix B, Paragraph 8.1;
  - d. All rights reserved by Paragraph 53;
- e. Civil penalties with respect to the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles, but only to the extent not previously resolved in the First California Partial Consent Decree;
- f. Any and all civil claims related to any 2.0 Liter Subject Vehicle, but only to the extent not previously resolved under the First Partial Consent Decree or First California Partial Consent Decree, or to any vehicle other than the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles;
- g. Any and all civil claims and administrative authorities for injunctive relief (i) based on facts that were not disclosed by Defendants to EPA and CARB prior to October 24, 2016, related to any defeat devices or AECDs installed on or in the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles; or (ii) related to any other failures by the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles to conform with the California Health and Safety Code or its implementing regulations;
  - h. Any criminal liability;
- i. Any part of any claims for the violation of securities or false claims laws;
  - j. Costs and attorneys' fees, including investigative costs, incurred

after the date of lodging;

- k. Claims for relief to customers, including claims for restitution, refunds, rescission, damages, and disgorgement, but only to the extent not previously resolved under the First Partial Consent Decree or First California Partial Consent Decree; and
- l. Any other claim(s) of any officer or agency of the State of California, other than CARB or CA AG.
- 77. By entering into this Consent Decree, the United States and California are not enforcing the laws of other countries, including the emissions laws or regulations of any jurisdiction outside the United States. Nothing in this Consent Decree is intended to apply to, or affect, Defendants' obligations under the laws or regulations of any jurisdiction outside the United States. At the same time, the laws and regulations of other countries shall not affect the Defendants' obligations under this Consent Decree.
- 78. This Consent Decree shall not be construed to limit the rights of the United States or California to obtain penalties or injunctive relief under the Act or implementing regulations, or under other federal or state laws, regulations, or permit conditions, except as specifically provided in Paragraph 74. The United States and California further reserve all legal and equitable remedies to address any imminent and substantial endangerment to the public health or welfare or the environment arising at any of Defendants' facilities, or posed by Defendants' 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles, whether related to the violations addressed in this Consent Decree or otherwise.
- 79. In any subsequent administrative or judicial proceeding initiated by the United States or California for injunctive relief, civil penalties, or other appropriate relief relating to

Defendants' violations, Defendants shall not assert, and may not maintain, any defense or claim based upon the principles of waiver, res judicata, collateral estoppel, issue preclusion, claim preclusion, claim-splitting, or other defenses based upon any contention that the claims raised by the United States or California in the subsequent proceeding were or should have been brought in the instant case, except with respect to the claims that have been specifically resolved pursuant to Paragraph 74.

- 80. This Consent Decree is not a permit, or a modification of any permit, under any federal, State, or local laws or regulations. Defendants are responsible for achieving and maintaining complete compliance with all applicable federal, State, and local laws, regulations, and permits; and Defendants' compliance with this Consent Decree shall be no defense to any action commenced pursuant to any such laws, regulations, or permits, except as set forth herein. The United States and California do not, by their consent to the entry of this Consent Decree, warrant or aver in any manner that Defendants' compliance with any aspect of this Consent Decree will result in compliance with provisions of the Act, or with any other provisions of United States, State, or local laws, regulations, or permits.
- 81. This Consent Decree does not limit or affect the rights of Defendants or of the United States or California against any third parties, not party to this Consent Decree, nor does it limit the rights of third parties, not party to this Consent Decree, against Defendants, except as otherwise provided by law.
- 82. This Consent Decree shall not be construed to create rights in, or grant any cause of action to, any third party not party to this Consent Decree.

#### XII. COSTS

83. The Parties shall bear their own costs of this Consent Decree, including attorneys'

fees, except that the United States and California shall be entitled to collect the costs and reasonable attorneys' fees incurred in any action necessary to collect any portion of the stipulated penalties due under this Consent Decree but not paid by Defendants.

#### XIII. NOTICES

84. Except as specified elsewhere in this Decree, whenever any Materials are required to be submitted pursuant to this Consent Decree, or whenever any communication is required in any action or proceeding related to or bearing upon this Consent Decree or the rights or obligations thereunder, they shall be submitted with a cover letter or otherwise be made in writing (except that if any attachment is voluminous, it shall be provided on a disk, hard drive, or other equivalent successor technology), and shall be addressed as follows:

As to the United States:	DOJ at the email or mail addresses below, with a preference for email unless otherwise specified and EPA at the email and mail addresses below
As to DOJ by mail:	EES Case Management Unit Environment and Natural Resources Division U.S. Department of Justice P.O. Box 7611 Washington, D.C. 20044-7611 Re: DJ # 90-5-2-1-11386
As to DOJ by overnight mail:	Chief Environmental Enforcement Section Environment and Natural Resources Division U.S. Department of Justice 601 D St. NW Washington, D.C. 20004
As to DOJ by email:	eescdcopy.enrd@usdoj.gov Re: DJ # 90-5-2-1-11386

## Case 3:15-md-02672-CRB Document 2520-1 Filed 12/20/16 Page 46 of 164

1 2 3 4 5	As to EPA:	By mail and email to: Director, Air Enforcement Division 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue NW William J Clinton South Building MC 2242A Washington, DC 20460 VW_settlement@epa.gov
6	As to California:	CARB and CA AG at the email or mail
7		addresses below, as applicable
8	As to CARB by email (including for Paragraphs 32, 55):	Alexandra.Kamel@arb.ca.gov
9	As to CARB by mail:	Chief Counsel
10		California Air Resources Board
11		Legal Office 1001 I Street
12		Sacramento, California 95814
13	As to CA AG by email:	nicklas.akers@doj.ca.gov
14		judith.fiorentini@doj.ca.gov david.zonana@doj.ca.gov
15	As to CA AG by mail:	Senior Assistant Attorney General
16	715 to Criffo by main.	Consumer Law Section
17		California Department of Justice 455 Golden Gate Ave., Suite 11000
18		San Francisco, CA 94102-7004
19		Senior Assistant Attorney General
20		Environment Section Office of the Attorney General
21		P.O. Box 944255
22		Sacramento, CA 94244-2550
23	As to Volkswagen AG by mail:	Volkswagen AG
24		Berliner Ring 2 38440 Wolfsburg, Germany
25		Attention: Company Secretary
26		
27		
28		
-		

1		With copies to each of the following:
2		Volkswagen AG
3		Berliner Ring 2 38440 Wolfsburg, Germany
4		Attention: Group General Counsel
5		Volkswagen Group of
6		America, Inc.
7		2200 Ferdinand Porsche Dr. Herndon, VA 20171
8		Attention: U.S. General Counsel
9	As to Audi AG by mail:	Audi AG
10		Auto-Union-Straße 1 85045 Ingolstadt, Germany
11		Attention: Company Secretary
12		With copies to each of the following:
13		Volkswagen AG
14		Berliner Ring 2
15		38440 Wolfsburg, Germany Attention: Group General Counsel
16		Volkswagen Group of
17		America, Inc.
18		2200 Ferdinand Porsche Dr. Herndon, VA 20171
		Attention: U.S. General Counsel
19	As to Volkswagen Group of	
20	America, Inc. by mail:	Volkswagen Group of
21		America, Inc. 2200 Ferdinand Porsche Dr.
22		Herndon, VA 20171
23		Attention: Company Secretary
24		With copies to each of the following:
25		Volkswagen Group of
26		America, Inc. 2200 Ferdinand Porsche Dr.
27		Herndon, VA 20171
28		Attention: President

# Case 3:15-md-02672-CRB Document 2520-1 Filed 12/20/16 Page 48 of 164

1		Volkswagen Group of America, Inc.
2		2200 Ferdinand Porsche Dr.
3		Herndon, VA 20171 Attention: U.S. General Counsel
4		Tricention Clar Concret County
5	As to Volkswagen Group of America Chattanooga Operations, LLC by mail:	Volkswagen Group of America
6		Chattanooga Operations, LLC
7		8001 Volkswagen Dr. Chattanooga, TN 37416
8		Attention: Company Secretary
9		With copies to each of the following:
10		Volkswagen Group of
11		America, Inc.
12		2200 Ferdinand Porsche Dr. Herndon, VA 20171
12		Attention: President
13		
14		Volkswagen Group of
15		America, Inc. 2200 Ferdinand Porsche Dr.
13		Herndon, VA 20171
16		Attention: U.S. General Counsel
17	As to Dr. Ing. h.c. F. Porsche AG by mail:	Dr. Ing. h.c. F. Porsche Aktiengesellschaft
18		Porscheplatz 1, D-70435 Stuttgart
19		Attention: GR/ Rechtsabteilung/ General Counsel
20	As to Porsche Cars North America, Inc.:	Porsche Cars North America, Inc.
21	As to I dische Cars North America, mc	1 Porsche Dr.
22		Atlanta, GA 30354 Attention: Secretary
23		With copy by email to offsecy@porsche.us
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

1		one or more of the	
2	Defe	ndants by email:	Robert J. Giuffra, Jr. Sharon L. Nelles
3			Granta Nakayama Cari Dawson
4			
5			giuffrar@sullcrom.com nelless@sullcrom.com
6			gnakayama@kslaw.com cari.dawson@alston.com
7		o one or more of the ndants by mail:	Robert J. Giuffra, Jr.
8	Dete	ilidants by man.	Sharon L. Nelles
9   10			Sullivan & Cromwell LLP 125 Broad Street New York, New York 10004
11			, and the second
12			Granta Nakayama King & Spalding LLP
13			1700 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 200 Washington, DC 20006
14			Cari Dawson
15			Alston & Bird LLP One Atlantic Center
16 17			1201 West Peachtree Street Atlanta, Georgia 30309-3424
18	85.	Any Party may, by written notice	e to the other Parties, change its designated notice
19	recipient or	notice address provided above.	
20	86.	Communications submitted purs	uant to this Section shall be deemed submitted
21		•	
22			where Defendants have a choice, or (2) where both
23	email and m	ail are required, when both method	ds have been accomplished, except as provided
24	elsewhere in	this Consent Decree or by mutual	agreement of the Parties in writing.
25	87.	The Parties anticipate that a non-	-public secure web-based electronic portal may be
26	developed in	the future for submission of Mate	erials. The Parties may agree in the future to use
27	such a portal	l, or any other means, for submissi	on of Materials. Any such agreement shall be
28	, a porta	,	
	I		

approved as a non-material modification to the Decree in accordance with Paragraphs 90-91.

#### XIV. <u>EFFECTIVE DATE</u>

88. The Effective Date of this Consent Decree shall be the date upon which this Consent Decree is entered by the Court or a motion to enter the Consent Decree is granted, whichever occurs first, as recorded on the Court's docket.

#### XV. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

89. The Court shall retain jurisdiction over this case until termination of this Consent Decree, for the purpose of resolving disputes arising under this Decree or entering orders modifying this Decree, pursuant to Sections IX and XVI, or effectuating or enforcing compliance with the terms of this Decree.

#### XVI. <u>MODIFICATION</u>

- 90. Except as otherwise provided herein or in the attached Appendices, the terms of this Consent Decree, including any attached Appendices, may be modified only by a subsequent written agreement signed by all the Parties. Where the modification constitutes a material change to this Decree, it shall be effective only upon approval by the Court.
- 91. The United States or California, as applicable, will file any non-material modifications with the Court. Once the non-material modification has been filed, Defendants shall post the filed version (with ECF stamp) on the website required by Paragraph 33.
- 92. Any disputes concerning modification of this Decree shall be resolved pursuant to Section IX (Dispute Resolution), provided, however, that instead of the burden of proof provided by Paragraph 65, the Party seeking the modification bears the burden of demonstrating that it is entitled to the requested modification in accordance with Fed. R. Civ. P. 60(b).

#### XVII. TERMINATION

- 93. After Defendants have completed the requirements of Section IV (Partial Injunctive Relief), except for Appendix A, Paragraphs 5.2, 6.2, 8.2 (No End Dates) and associated requirements, have complied with all other requirements of this Consent Decree, and have paid any accrued stipulated penalties as required by this Consent Decree, Defendants may serve upon the United States and California a Request for Termination, stating that Defendants have satisfied those requirements, together with all necessary supporting documentation.
- 94. Following receipt by the United States and California of Defendants' Request for Termination, the Parties shall confer informally concerning the Request and any disagreement that the Parties may have as to whether Defendants have satisfactorily complied with the requirements for termination of this Consent Decree. If the United States, after consultation with California, agrees that the Decree may be terminated, the United States will file a motion to terminate the Decree, provided, however, that the provisions associated with effectuating and enforcing Appendix A, Paragraph 5.2, 6.2, 8.2 (No End Dates) shall continue in full force and effect indefinitely.
- 95. If the United States, after consultation with California, does not agree that the Decree may be terminated, Defendants may invoke Dispute Resolution under Section IX. However, Defendants shall not seek Dispute Resolution of any dispute regarding termination until 45 Days after service of their Request for Termination.

## XVIII. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

96. This Consent Decree shall be lodged with the Court for a period of not less than 30 Days for public notice and comment in accordance with 28 C.F.R. § 50.7. The United States reserves the right to withdraw or withhold its consent if the comments regarding the Consent

Decree disclose facts or considerations indicating that the Consent Decree is inappropriate, improper, or inadequate. California reserves the right to withdraw or withhold its consent if the United States does so. Defendants consent to entry of this Consent Decree without further notice and agree not to withdraw from or oppose entry of this Consent Decree by the Court or to challenge any provision of the Decree, unless the United States has notified Defendants in writing that it no longer supports entry of the Decree.

#### XIX. <u>SIGNATORIES/SERVICE</u>

- 97. Each undersigned representative of Defendants and California, and the Assistant Attorney General for the Environment and Natural Resources Division of the DOJ certifies that he or she is fully authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Consent Decree and to execute and legally bind the Party he or she represents to this document.
- 98. This Consent Decree may be signed in counterparts, and its validity shall not be challenged on that basis. For purposes of this Consent Decree, a signature page that is transmitted electronically (*e.g.*, by facsimile or e-mailed "PDF") shall have the same effect as an original.

### XX. <u>INTEGRATION</u>

99. This Consent Decree constitutes the final, complete, and exclusive agreement and understanding among the Parties with respect to the settlement embodied in the Decree and supersedes all prior agreements and understandings, whether oral or written, concerning the settlement embodied herein. Other than deliverables that are subsequently submitted and approved pursuant to this Decree, the Parties acknowledge that there are no documents, representations, inducements, agreements, understandings, or promises that constitute any part of this Decree or the settlement it represents other than those expressly contained in this Consent

Decree. 1 2 XXI. FINAL JUDGMENT 3 100. Upon approval and entry of this Consent Decree by the Court, this Consent Decree 4 shall constitute a final judgment of the Court as to the United States, California, and Defendants. 5 The Court finds that there is no just reason for delay and therefore enters this judgment as a final 6 judgment under Fed. R. Civ. P. 54 and 58. 7 8 XXII. **APPENDICES** 9 101. The following Appendices (and any attachments thereto) are attached to and part 10 of this Consent Decree: 11 "Appendix A" is the Buyback, Lease Termination, Vehicle Modification, and Emissions 12 Compliant Recall Program. 13 "Appendix B" is the Vehicle Recall and Emissions Modification Program for 3.0 Liter Subject 14 Vehicles. 15 "Initial 3.0 Liter Mitigation Allocation Appendix" ("Mitigation Appendix") is the initial 16 allocation of Mitigation Trust funds for the 3.0 Liter Subject Vehicles. 17 18 19 20 21 Dated and entered this \_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2017, 22 23 24 25 CHARLES R. BREYER UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE 26 27 28 51

1 FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA: 2 3 December 20, 2016 4 Date ssistant Attorney General 5 Environment and Natural Resources Division U.S. Department of Justice 6 7 8 9 **BETHANY ENGEL** 10 GABRIEL ALLEN LESLIE ALLEN 11 PATRICK BRYAN **NIGEL COONEY** 12 KAREN DWORKIN 13 DANICA GLASER **RUBEN GOMEZ** 14 **ANNA GRACE** SHEILA McANANEY 15 **ROBERT MULLANEY** 16 ERIKA WELLS 17 **IVA ZIZA** 18 19 P.O. Box 7611 20 21 22 23 24 Counsel for the United States 25 26 27 28

JOSHUA H. VAN EATON RICHIE KHANH NGUYEN **Environmental Enforcement Section** Environment and Natural Resources Division United States Department of Justice Washington, D.C. 20044-7611 Telephone: (202) 514-5474 Facsimile: (202) 514-0097 josh.van.eaton@usdoj.gov bethany.engel@usdoj.gov

FOR THE U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY: 1 2 3 CYNTHIA GILES Assistant Administrator 4 Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 5 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. 6 Washington, DC 20460 7 8 SUSAN SHINKMAN 9 Director, Office of Civil Enforcement Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance 10 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. 11 Washington, DC 20460 12 13 PHILLIP A. BROOKS 14 Director, Air Enforcement Division 15 Office of Civil Enforcement Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance 16 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 17 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20460 18 19 20 **EVAN BELSER** MEETU KAUL 21 SEEMA KAKADE **BRIANNA IDDINGS** 22 Air Enforcement Division 23 Office of Civil Enforcement Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance 24 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW 25 Washington, DC 20460 26 27 28

1 FOR THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA BY AND THROUGH THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD AND KAMALA D. HARRIS, ATTORNEY 2 GENERAL OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA: 3 DEC. 7,2016 4 NICKLAS A. AKERS (CA-211222) 5 Senior Assistant Attorney General California Department of Justice 6 455 Golden Gate Ave., Suite 11000 San Francisco, CA 94102-7004 Telephone: (415) 703-5500 8 E-mail: nicklas.akers@doj.ca.gov KAMALA D. HARRIS 9 Attorney General of California 10 ROBERT W. BYRNE SALLY MAGNANI 11 Senior Assistant Attorneys General JUDITH A. FIORENTINI 12 GAVIN G. McCABE 13 DAVID A. ZONANA Supervising Deputy Attorneys General 14 AMOS E. HARTSTON LAUREL M. CARNES 15 WILLIAM R. PLETCHER 16 ELIZABETH B. RUMSEY JOHN S. SASAKI 17 JON F. WORM 18 Deputy Attorneys General 19 Attorneys for the People of the State of California 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28

1	FOR THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOU	JRCES BOARD:
2		1.1 111.1
3	December 7, 2016	Upay of Wichol
4		MARY D. NICHOLS Chair
5		California Air Resources Board
5		1001 I Street
6		Sacramento, CA 95814
7		
8		PICHAPP W COPEN
		RICHARD W. COREY Executive Officer
9		California Air Resources Board
10		1001 I Street
11		Sacramento, CA 95814
12		AN MDT
13		ELLEN M. PETER
1.4		Chief Counsel Chief Counsel
14		D. ARON LIVINGSTON
15		Assistant Chief Counsel
16		DIANE KIYOTA ALEXANDRA KAMEL
17		Attorneys, Legal Office
		California Air Resources Board
18		1001 I Street Sacramento, CA 95814
19		Sacramento, CA 93814
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		

FOR VOLKSWAGEN AG:

Date: Dec. 6, 2016

FRANCISOO JAVIER GARCIA SANZ

VOLKSWAGEN AG

P.O. Box 1849

D-38436 Wolfsburg, Germany

Date: Dec. 6, 2016

MANFRED DOESS VOLKSWAGEN AG

P.O. Box 1849

D-38436 Wolfsburg, Germany

FOR AUDI AG:

Date: Dec. 6, 2016

BERND MARTENS

AUDI AC

Auto-Union-Straße 1 85045 Ingolstadt, Germany

Date: Dec. 6, 2016

MARTIN WAGENER

**AUDI AG** 

Auto-Union-Straße 1 85045 Ingolstadt, Germany FOR VOLKSWAGEN GROUP OF AMERICA, INC.:

Date: Dec. 6, 2016

DAVID DETWEILER

VOLKSWAGEN GROUP OF AMERICA, INC.

2200 Ferdinand Porsche Drive Herndon, Virginia 20171 FOR VOLKSWAGEN GROUP OF AMERICA CHATTANOOGA OPERATIONS, LLC:

Date: Dec. 6, 2016

DAVID DETWEILER

VOLKSWAGEN GROUP OF AMERICA, INC.

2200 Ferdinand Porsche Drive Herndon, Virginia 20171 COUNSEL FOR VOLKSWAGEN AG, AUDI AG, VOLKSWAGEN GROUP OF AMERICA, INC., and VOLKSWAGEN GROUP OF AMERICA CHATTANOOGA OPERATIONS, LLC

Dec. 6, 2016

ROBERT J. GIUFFRA, JR. SHARON L. NELLES WILLIAM B. MONAHAN Sullivan & Cromwell LLP 125 Broad Street

New York, New York 10004 Telephone: (212) 558-4000 Facsimile: (212) 558-3358 giuffrar@sullcrom.com nelless@sullcrom.com monahanw@sullcrom.com FOR DR. ING. H.C. F. PORSCHE AG:

Date: Dec. 6, 2016

DR. MICHAEL STEINER
Member of the Executive Board
-Research and Development-

DR. ING. h.c. F. PORSCHE AKTIENGESELLSCHAFT Porschestrasse 911 71287 Weissach, Germany

Date: Dec. 6,2016

pps. Oyels. Krest

General Counsel & Chief Compliance Officer

DR. ING. h.c. F. PORSCHE AKTIENGESELLSCHAFT

Porscheplatz 1

70435 Stuttgart-Zuffenhausen, Germany

SECOND PARTIAL CONSENT DECREE MDL No. 2672 CRB (JSC)

FOR PORSCHE CARS NORTH AMERICA, INC.:

Date: Dec. 6, 2016

JOSEPH S. FOLZ

Vice President, General Counsel and Secretary PORSCHE CARS NORTH AMERICA, INC.

1 Porsche Drive Atlanta, GA 30354

Date: Dec. 6, 2016

TIM OUINN

Vice President, After Sales

PORSCHE CARS NORTH AMERICA, INC.

l Porsche Drive Atlanta, GA 30354

COUNSEL FOR DR.	ING. h.c. F. PORSCHE	AG and PORSCHE	CARS NORTH	AMERICA,
INC.:				

Date: Dec. 6, 2016

GRANTA NAKAYAMA JOSEPH A. EISERT

King & Spalding LLP 1700 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 200

Washington, DC 20006 gnakayama@kslaw.com jeisert@kslaw.com

Date:

CARI DAWSON
Alston & Bird LLP
One Atlantic Center
1201 West Peachtree Street
Atlanta, Georgia 30309-3424
cari.dawson@alston.com

COUNSEL FOR DR. ING. h.c. F. PORSCHE AG and PORSCHE CARS NORTH AMERICA, INC.:

Date:

GRANTA NAKAYAMA
JOSEPH A. EISERT
King & Spalding LLP
1700 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006
gnakayama@kslaw.com
jeisert@kslaw.com

Date: Dec. 6, 2016

CARI DAWSON
Alston & Bird LLP
One Atlantic Center
1201 West Peachtree Street
Atlanta, Georgia 30309-3424
cari.dawson@alston.com

1	JOHN C. CRUDEN		
2	Assistant Attorney General Environment and Natural Resources Division	ı	
3	IOSUIIA U WANEATON (WA 30871)		
4	JOSHUA H. VAN EATON (WA-39871) BETHANY ENGEL (MA-660840)		
5	Trial Attorneys		
6	Environmental Enforcement Section		
7	U.S. Department of Justice P.O. Box 7611		
	Washington DC 20044-7611		
8	Telephone: (202) 514-5474		
9	Facsimile: (202) 514-0097		
10	Email: Josh.Van.Eaton@usdoj.gov		
11	Attorneys for Plaintiff United States of Ameri	ica	
12		ES DISTRICT COURT	
13		TRICT OF CALIFORNIA ICISCO DIVISION	
	SAN FRAN	ICISCO DI VISION	
14		)	
15	IN RE: VOLKSWAGEN "CLEAN DIESEL" MARKETING, SALES	) Case No: MDL No. 2672 CRB (JSC)	
16	PRACTICES, AND PRODUCTS	) NOTICE OF LODGING OF SECOND	
17	LIABILITY LITIGATION	) PARTIAL CONSENT DECREE	
18		) Hon. Charles R. Breyer	
19			
20		) )	
20			
22	Consistent with the requirements of 2	8 C.F.R. § 50.7, a proposed Second Partial Consent	
23	Decree is being lodged with the Court in this	Civil Action, after having been concurred to and	
24	signed by all relevant parties in this matter.	Δ fter the requisite Federal Register Notice is	
25			
26	published, the time period for comments has	run, and the comments, if any, have been evaluated,	
27	the Court will be further advised as to any ac	tion that may be required by the Court at that time.	
28			
		NOTICE OF LODGING OF SECOND	

PARTIAL CONSENT DECREE MDL No. 2672 CRB (JSC)

## Case 3:15-md-02672-CRB Document 2520 Filed 12/20/16 Page 2 of 2

1	During the pendency of the Federal Regi	ister Notice comment period, no action is required of the
2	Court.	
3 4	Dated: December 20, 2016	Respectfully submitted,
		JOHN C. CRUDEN
5		Assistant Attorney General
6		Environment and Natural Resources Division U.S. Department of Justice
7		-
8		Day /a/ Badhawa Earad
9		By: <u>/s/ Bethany Engel</u> JOSHUA H. VAN EATON
10		BETHANY ENGEL
		GABRIEL ALLEN
11		LESLIE ALLEN
12		PATRICK BRYAN
		NIGEL COONEY RUBEN GOMEZ
13		ANNA GRACE
14		SHEILA McANANEY
ا ہ.		ROBERT MULLANEY
15		RICHIE KHANH NGUYEN
16		ERIKA WELLS
		IVA ZIZA
17		Environmental Enforcement Section Environment and Natural Resources Division
18		United States Department of Justice
10		P.O. Box 7611
19		Washington, D.C. 20044-7611
20		Telephone: (202) 514-5474
21		Facsimile: (202) 514-0097
		josh.van.eaton@usdoj.gov
22		bethany.engel@usdoj.gov
23		Counsel for the United States
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
40		

2